

כִּי סָלִיק רַבִּי אַבָּא מִיַּמֵּי פִּירְשָׁה: מוֹדִים
חֲכָמִים לְרַבֵּן גַּמְלִיאֵל בְּבִרְכוֹת שֶׁל רֹאשׁ
הַשָּׁנָה וְשֶׁל יוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים, וְהֵלְכָה מִבְּלָלָהּ
דְּפִלְגִי – בְּבִרְכוֹת דְּכָל הַשָּׁנָה.

אֵינִי?! וְהָאֵמֵר רַבִּי חֲנָנִי צִיפּוֹרָאָה אָמַר רַבִּי
יִחְזִקֵּי: הֵלְכָה בְּרַבֵּן גַּמְלִיאֵל בְּבִרְכוֹת רֹאשׁ
הַשָּׁנָה וְשֶׁל יוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים!

אֵלָּא אָמַר רַב נַחֲמָן בְּרַיְצָהק: מֵאֵן מוֹדִים –
רַבִּי מֵאִיר, וְהֵלְכָה מִבְּלָלָהּ דְּפִלְגִי – רַבֵּן.

דִּתְנֵנָּא: בְּרְכוֹת שֶׁל רֹאשׁ הַשָּׁנָה וְשֶׁל יוֹם
הַכִּפּוּרִים – שְׁלִיחַ עֲבוּר מוֹצֵיא הַרְבֵּים יְדֵי
חוּבְתָן, דְּבִרְי רַבִּי מֵאִיר. וְחֲכָמִים אוֹמְרִים:
כְּשֶׁם שְׁשִׁלִּיחַ עֲבוּר חַיִּיב – כֶּךָ כָּל יַחֲיד
וְיַחֲיד חַיִּיב.

מֵאִי שָׁנָא הֵנִי? אֵילִימָא מִשּׁוּם דְּנִפְיִשִׁי
קְרָאִי – וְהָאֵמֵר רַב חֲנַנְיָא אָמַר רַב: בֵּינּוּ
שְׁאָמַר "וּבִתְוֹרָתְךָ כְּתוּב לֵאמֹר" – שׁוּב
אֵינוֹ צָרִיךְ. אֵלָּא מִשּׁוּם דְּאִוּשֵׁי בְּרְכוֹת.

The Gemara answers: **When Rabbi Abba returned from his travels at sea, he explained the matter as follows: The Sages concede to the opinion of Rabban Gamliel with regard to the blessings of Rosh HaShana and of Yom Kippur, that in these cases the prayer leader fulfills the obligation on behalf of the many. And Rabbi Yoḥanan's statement that the *halakha* is in accordance with Rabban Gamliel, which, by inference, indicates that the *tanna'im* still disagree,^H is referring to the blessings of the entire year.**

The Gemara raises a difficulty. **Is that so? Didn't Rabbi Ḥana from the city of Tzipori say^N that Rabbi Yoḥanan said: The *halakha* is in accordance with the opinion of Rabban Gamliel with regard to the blessings of Rosh HaShana and of Yom Kippur? Apparently, he holds that the *tanna'im* remain in dispute even with regard to these blessings.**

Rather, Rabbi Yoḥanan's statements must be attributed to different Sages, as Rav Naḥman bar Yitzḥak said: **Who concedes to the opinion of Rabban Gamliel? Rabbi Meir. And with regard to Rabbi Yoḥanan's ruling that the *halakha* is in accordance with Rabban Gamliel, which, by inference, indicates that the *tanna'im* still disagree, this is referring to the Rabbis, who disagree with Rabbi Meir.**

The Gemara explains: **As it is taught in a *baraita*: With regard to the blessings of Rosh HaShana and of Yom Kippur, the prayer leader fulfills the obligation on behalf of the many. This is the statement of Rabbi Meir. And the Rabbis say: Just as the prayer leader is obligated in these prayers, so too, every individual is obligated to recite them on his own. Clearly, Rabbi Meir agrees with Rabban Gamliel with regard to the blessings of Rosh HaShana and Yom Kippur, while the Rabbis dispute this ruling.**

The Gemara asks: **What is different about these blessings of Rosh HaShana and Yom Kippur, that Rabbi Meir concedes to the opinion of Rabban Gamliel only with regard to them, but not about the blessings recited the rest of the year? If we say that it is due to the many verses that are included in these blessings, this is difficult. Didn't Rav Ḥananel say that Rav said: Once one has recited the line of the prayer: And in Your Torah it is written, saying,^{NH} it is no longer necessary to recite the verses themselves. Rather, it is because there are many blessings,^N and as the blessings are long, not everyone is capable of learning them by heart.**

HALAKHA

The *halakha* which by inference indicates that the *tanna'im* disagree – הֵלְכָה מִבְּלָלָהּ דְּפִלְגִי: An expert may not fulfill his obligation to pray through the recitation of the prayer leader. However, one who does not know how to pray may do so (*Magen Avraham*). He must focus on what the prayer leader is saying from beginning to end without pause. When the prayer leader finishes, the listener takes three steps back, just like one who prays on his own. In certain places the custom is for all who came to the synagogue, regardless of whether they are expert or not, to take three steps back at the same time as the prayer leader. In any case, one must understand what the prayer leader is saying. If he does not understand at least the first three blessing of the *Amida* he does not fulfill his obligation; in that case it is preferable for him to pray in a language he understands (*Shulḥan Arukh HaRav*). Some say that even if one does not understand the prayers, he fulfills his obligation, provided that he recites the prayers word for word together with the prayer leader (*Arukh HaShulḥan*, citing *Bah*). The early authorities are uncertain whether or not the *halakha* is in accordance with the opinion of Rabban Gamliel with regard to the year-round prayers. With regard to Rosh HaShana, although the entire congregation recites the silent prayer, the *halakha* is in accordance with the opinion of Rabban Gamliel, who maintains that the prayer leader may fulfill everyone's obligation. Still, everyone must focus and follow word for word with the prayer leader. If one cannot come to the synagogue due to circumstances beyond his control, the prayer leader fulfills his obligation for him (*Tur, Oraḥ Ḥayyim* 591; *Shulḥan Arukh, Oraḥ Ḥayyim* 124:1).

Once one has recited: **And in Your Torah it is written, saying – בֵּינּוּ שְׁאָמַר וּבִתְוֹרָתְךָ כְּתוּב לֵאמֹר –** Although one must recite the ten verses of Kingship, remembrance, and *shofarot, ab initio*, if one did not begin to recite the verses at all and said only: **And in Your Torah it is written, saying,** he has fulfilled his obligation, in accordance with the opinion of Rav Ḥananel (*Tur*, cited by Rema). With regard to the verses of the Festival offerings, the Sephardic custom is not to recite them, whereas the Ashkenazic custom is to recite them (*Shulḥan Arukh, Oraḥ Ḥayyim* 591:4, and in the comment of Rema).

NOTES

וְהָאֵמֵר – Didnt Rabbi Ḥana from the city of Tzipori say – רַבִּי חֲנַנְיָא צִיפּוֹרָאָה: The commentaries discuss the relationship between the statement of Rabbi Ḥana from the city of Tzipori here and his statement on *daf* 34b (Responsa of Rav Hai Gaon). Are they two separate statements of Rabbi Yoḥanan, one referring to Rosh HaShana and Yom Kippur, and the other to the rest of the days of the year? If so, one should accept this version, which maintains that Rabbi Yoḥanan was referring only to Rosh HaShana, but during the rest of the year the *halakha* is in accordance with the opinion of the Rabbis, as indicated in the Jerusalem Talmud. Or, perhaps these are two versions of the same ruling of Rabbi Yoḥanan, referring only to Rosh HaShana and Yom Kippur. If so, the *halakha* is in accordance with the opinion of Rabban Gamliel with regard to the prayers all year round.

Once one has recited: **And in Your Torah it is written, saying – בֵּינּוּ שְׁאָמַר וּבִתְוֹרָתְךָ כְּתוּב לֵאמֹר –** Rashi suggests two explanations of this statement of Rav Ḥananel. Either it is referring to the verses of the additional offerings of the Festival or to the blessings of Kingship, Remembrances, and *shofarot*. Most early authorities and the *geonim* accept the second explanation, although many Sephardic communities act in accordance with the first interpretation (see Rosh). Rashi points out that this ruling is apparently not in accordance with either the opinion of the Rabbis or that of Rabbi Yoḥanan ben Nuri (see 32a). This difficulty has been resolved in several ways. Perhaps that dispute is referring only to one who has begun reciting the verses, but if one did not start he need not recite them (Rabbeinu Tam in *Tosafot*). Alternatively, Rav Ḥananel actually rules in accordance with the opinion of Rabbi Yoḥanan ben Nuri. According to this

explanation, one must recite all three introductory formulas: **And in Your Torah it is written, saying; In the writings of Your Prophets it is written, saying; and: In Your Sacred Writings it is written, saying.** However, one need not recite the verses themselves (Ramban). Others maintain that one must say: **And in Your Torah it is written, saying,** followed by at least one verse from the Torah (Rambam). Some explain that according to this opinion Rabbi Yoḥanan ben Nuri holds that after the fact it is enough if one recites one verse each of Kingship, remembrances, and *shofarot* (*Maggid Mishneh*).

There are many [avshi] blessings – דְּאִוּשֵׁי בְּרְכוֹת – Some suggest that the term *avshi* is a derivative of *avsha*, which means a sound or a noise (Rosh). The Rosh further explains that people recite these verses out loud because they are not fluent in them, and this noise bothers and confuses others.

Arranging the prayer – הסדרת התפילה: With regard to unfamiliar prayers, e.g., the Festival prayers and those for the New Moon, one should arrange and review the prayers beforehand, in accordance with the opinion of Rabbi Elazar and Rabbi Abba. Some say this applies only when one prays by heart. However, when using a prayer book this is not necessary. This is the accepted custom (Rema). However, some authorities are stringent even with regard to one who is using a prayer book (*Ateret Zahav*, citing *Beit Yosef*, *Shulhan Arukh*, *Orah Hayyim* 100:1).

People behind the priests – עם שאחורי כהנים: Anyone standing behind the priests when they bless the people in the synagogue are not included in the blessing. Consequently, those sitting on the east wall of the synagogue must move and stand at least to the side of the priests (*Taz*; *Bah*). Furthermore, everyone must turn his face toward the priests, not the wall (*Shulhan Arukh HaRav*; *Mishna Berura*). Provided that one is standing in front of the priests or to their sides, not even an iron barrier is considered an interposition between them with regard to the blessing. Even those who cannot come due to circumstances beyond their control, e.g., those in the fields, are included in the Priestly Blessing (*Shulhan Arukh*, *Orah Hayyim* 128:24).

Rabban Gamliel allowed the prayer leader to exempt only the people in the fields – לא פטר רבן גמליאל אלא עם שבשדות: On the New Moon, if one forgot to recite the addition whose omission necessitates the repetition of the prayer, i.e., the paragraph beginning: May there rise and come [*ya'aleh veyavo*], he should focus on the recitation of the prayer leader throughout the entire prayer as though he himself were praying. The one who forgot has the halakhic status of one who is subject to circumstances beyond his control, as he did not mean to forget, and therefore the prayer leader exempts him. However, it is preferable to repeat the prayer oneself, as not everyone can focus his intent for the entire repetition of the prayer leader (*Bah*; Rabbi Shlomo Luria; *Shulhan Arukh*, *Orah Hayyim* 128:24).

PERSONALITIES

Rav Yehuda – רב יהודה: Rav Yehuda bar Yehezkel was one of the great Babylonian Sages of the second generation of *amora'im*. He studied under both Rav and Shmuel. Shmuel often spoke highly of Rav Yehuda and even remarked in admiration: This cannot be an ordinary mortal. Following Shmuel's passing, Rav Yehuda was appointed head of the Neharde'a academy in his stead. He moved the academy to his hometown of Pumbedita, where it remained for over seven hundred years and produced many of the Jewish nation's leading scholars.

In addition to his scholarship, Rav Yehuda was known for his piety, and it was said about him that he did not walk four cubits standing fully upright due to his fear of sin. His life was devoted entirely to Torah study, and he lived in poverty until he was appointed head of the academy.

Most scholars of the third generation of *amora'im* were Rav Yehuda's students, including his son, Rav Yitzhak. Even those who studied in the academy in Sura became his students after Rav Huna's passing. Although Rav Yehuda believed that there are biblical verses that prohibit moving to Eretz Yisrael from Babylonia, he was well known for his love of Eretz Yisrael. In fact, most of his students immigrated to Eretz Yisrael, where they became leading *amora'im*.

NOTES

People who were in the fields – עם שבשדות: The early authorities are puzzled by Rabban Gamliel's exemption of those who are in the fields. It apparently contradicts the opinions of both Rabban Gamliel and the Rabbinis in the dispute in the mishna that pertains to those who are or are not expert, as here Rabban Gamliel exempts only those who are victims of circumstances beyond their control. Some explain that Rabban Gamliel's exemption is referring to those in the fields who did not come to the synagogue at all, whereas the dispute with regard to experts is referring to those who are in the synagogue. It is further stated in the Jerusalem Talmud that one must hear the entire prayer of the prayer leader, a ruling accepted by most halakhic authorities. In this case, the prayer leader fulfills the obligation of experts as well (*Tosefot Yom Tov*). Some texts read: Rabban Gamliel exempts those in the synagogue as well as those in the fields (Ramban; Rabbeinu Hananel). According to this version, there is no contradiction between the two statements of Rabban Gamliel.

גופא, אמר רב חננאל אמר רב: כיון שפאמר "ובתורתך כתוב לאמר" – שוב אינו צריך. סבור מנחה: הני מילי – בנחיד, אבל בצבור – לא. אתמר, אמר רבי יהושע בן לוי: אחד יחיד אחד צבור, כיון שפאמר "ובתורתך כתוב לאמר" – שוב אינו צריך.

אמר רבי אלעזר: לעולם יסדי אדם תפלתו ואחר כך יתפלל. אמר רבי אבא: מסתברא מילתיה דרבי אלעזר בברכות של ראש השנה ושל יום הכפורים ושל פרקים, אבל דכל השנה – לא.

איני? והא רב יהודה מסדר צלותיה ומצלי! שאני רב יהודה, כיון דמתלתין יומין לתלתין יומין הוה מצלי – כפרקים דמי.

אמר רב אחא בר עירא אמר רבי שמעון חסידא: פטר היה רבן גמליאל אפילו עם שבשדות, ולא מבטליה הני דקיימי הכא?

אדרבה, הני – אמיסי, הני – לא אמיסי,

דתני אבא בריה דרב במנין בר חיאי: עם שאחורי כהנים – אינן בכלל ברכה!

אלא: כי אתא רבין אמר רבי יעקב בר אידי אמר רבי שמעון חסידא: לא פטר רבן גמליאל אלא עם שבשדות. מאי טעמא? משום דאמיסי במלאכה, אבל בעיר – לא.

הדרן עלך יום טוב
וסליקא לה מסכת ראש השנה

The Gemara discusses the matter itself. Rav Hananel said that Rav said: **Once one has recited the line of the prayer: And in Your Torah it is written, saying, it is no longer necessary to recite the verses themselves.** The Gemara clarifies the scope of this ruling: Some understood from this that it applies only to an individual; however, with regard to a congregation, no, this is not the case. Nevertheless, it is stated that Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi said: **Both with regard to an individual and a congregation, once one has recited: And in Your Torah it is written, saying, it is no longer necessary to recite the verses.**

S Rabbi Elazar said: A person should always arrange his prayer in his mind and only then pray.¹⁴ Rabbi Abba said: Rabbi Elazar's statement is reasonable with regard to the blessings of Rosh HaShana and Yom Kippur and in the case of prayers that are recited only intermittently. However, with regard to blessings recited all year, no, this practice is not necessary.

The Gemara asks: **Is that so? Didn't Rav Yehuda¹⁵ first arrange his prayer in his mind and only then pray, even on an ordinary day?** The Gemara answers: **Rav Yehuda was different, since he would pray only once every thirty days.** During the rest of the month he would not engage in prayer, as he was busy with Torah study. Therefore, for him even regular weekdays prayers were like prayers recited intermittently.

Rav Aha bar Avira said that Rabbi Shimon Hasida said: **Rabban Gamliel would allow the prayer leader to exempt even the people who were in the fields¹⁶ and away from the synagogue.** The Gemara challenges: This statement implies that the prayer leader exempts even the people in the fields, and needless to say, he exempts those who are here in the city but did not attend the prayer service in the synagogue.

The Gemara questions this conclusion: **On the contrary, the opposite is more reasonable: Those in the fields did not come to the synagogue due to circumstances beyond their control, and therefore they should be allowed to fulfill their obligation through the prayer leader.** By contrast, those in the city were not prevented from coming to the synagogue due to circumstances beyond their control. Consequently, they should not fulfill their obligation through the prayer leader.

As Abba, son of Rav Binyamin bar Hiyya, taught in a baraita: Those people standing in the synagogue behind the priests¹⁷ during the Priestly Blessing, who are not positioned in front of them, face-to-face, are not included in the blessing. They are expected to make the minimal effort to stand in front of the priests. However, those in the fields are included in the Priestly Blessing.

Rather, Rabban Gamliel's statement should be understood differently: **When Ravin came from Eretz Yisrael to Babylonia, he reported that Rabbi Ya'akov bar Idi said that Rabbi Shimon bar Hasida said: Rabban Gamliel allowed the prayer leader to exempt only the people in the fields.¹⁸ What is the reason for this? Because the people in the fields are unable to come to the synagogue due to work circumstances beyond their control, and do not have time to prepare their prayers. However, Rabban Gamliel did not exempt those in the city who do not come to the synagogue, as they are able to prepare their prayers and pray by themselves.**