HALAKHA

The halakha which by inference indicates that the tanna’im disagree—דִּפְלִיגִי

The Gemara answers: When Rabbi Abba returned from his travels at sea, he explained the matter as follows: The Sages concede to the opinion of Rabban Gamliel with regard to the blessings of Rosh HaShana and of Yom Kippur, that in these cases the prayer leader fulfills the obligation on behalf of the many. And Rabbi Yohanan’s statement that the halakha is in accordance with Rabban Gamliel, which, by inference, indicates that the tanna’im still disagree, is referring to the blessings of the entire year.

The Gemara raises a difficulty. Is that so? Didn’t Rabbi Hana from the city of Tzippori say that Rabbi Yohanan said: The halakha is in accordance with the opinion of Rabban Gamliel with regard to the blessings of Rosh HaShana and of Yom Kippur? Apparently, he holds that the tanna’im remain in dispute even with regard to these blessings.

Rather, Rabbi Yohanan’s statements must be attributed to different Sages, as Rav Nahman bar Yitzhak said: Who conceeds to the opinion of Rabban Gamliel? Rabbi Meir. And with regard to Rabbi Yohanan’s ruling that the halakha is in accordance with Rabban Gamliel, which, by inference, indicates that the tanna’im still disagree, this is referring to the Rabbis, who disagree with Rabbi Meir.

The Gemara explains: As it is taught in a baraita: With regard to the blessings of Rosh HaShana and of Yom Kippur, the prayer leader fulfills the obligation on behalf of the many. This is the statement of Rabbi Meir. And the Rabbis say: Just as the prayer leader is obligated in these prayers, so too, every individual is obligated to recite them on his own. Clearly, Rabbi Meir agrees with Rabban Gamliel with regard to the blessings of Rosh HaShana and Yom Kippur, while the Rabbis dispute this ruling.

The Gemara asks: What is different about these blessings of Rosh HaShana and Yom Kippur, that Rabbi Meir concedes to the opinion of Rabban Gamliel only with regard to them, but not about the blessings recited the rest of the year? If we say that it is due to the many verses that are included in these blessings, this is difficult. Didn’t Rav Hananel say that Rav said: Once has recited the line of the prayer: And in Your Torah it is written, saying, and it is no longer necessary to recite the verses themselves. Rather, it is because there are many blessings, and as the blessings are long, not everyone is capable of learning them by heart.

NOTES

Didn’t Rabbi Hana from the city of Tzippori say—דִּפְלִיגִי

The commentaries discuss the relationship between the statement of Rabbi Hana from the city of Tzippori here and his statement on daf Tub’a (Responsa of Rav Hai Gaon). Are they two separate statements of Rabbi Yohanan, one referring to Rosh HaShana and Yom Kippur, and the other to the rest of the days of the year? If so, one should accept this version, which maintains that Rabbi Yohanan was referring only to Rosh HaShana, but during the rest of the year the halakha is in accordance with the opinion of the Rabbis, as indicated in the Jerusalem Talmud. Or, perhaps these are two versions of the same ruling of Rabbi Yohanan, referring only to Rosh HaShana and Yom Kippur. If so, the halakha is in accordance with the opinion of Rabban Gamliel with regard to the prayers all year round.

Once one has recited: And in Your Torah it is written, saying –דִּפְלִיגִי

The Rosh suggests two explanations of this statement of Rav Hananel. Either it is referring to the verses of the additional offerings of the Festival or to the blessings of Kingship, Remembrances, and Shofarot. Most early authorities and the Gemara accept the second explanation, although many Sephardic communities act in accordance with the first interpretation (see Rashi). Rashi points out that this ruling is apparently not in accordance with either the opinion of the Rabbis or that of Rabbi Yohanan ben Nuni (see 32a). This difficulty has been resolved in several ways. Perhaps that dispute is referring only to one who has begun reciting the verses, but if one did not start he need not recite them (Rabbinu Tam in Tosafot). Alternatively, Rav Hananel actually rules in accordance with the opinion of Rabbi Yohanan ben Nuni. According to this explanation, one must recite all three introductory formulas: And in Your Torah it was written, saying; In the writings of Your Prophets it is written, saying; and; In Your Sacred Writings it is written, saying. However, one need not recite the verses at all and said only: And in Your Torah it is written, saying, he has fulfilled his obligation, in accordance with the opinion of Rav Hananel (Tur, cited by Rema). With regard to the verses of the Festival offerings, the Sephardic custom is not to recite them, whereas the Ashkenazi custom is to recite them (Shulhan Arukh, Orach Hayyim 591, and in the comment of Rema).

There are many [avsh] blessings—דִּפְלִיגִי

Some suggest that the term avsh is a derivative of orsho, which means a sound or a noise (Rosh). The Rosh further explains that people recite these verses out loud because they are not fluent in them, and this noise bothers and confuses others.
HALAKHA

Arranging the prayer – Shabbat: With regard to unfamiliar prayers, e.g., the Festival prayers and those for the New Moon, one should arrange and review the prayers beforehand, in accordance with the opinion of Rabbi Elazar and Rabbi Abba. Some say this applies only when one prays by heart. However, when using a prayer book this is not necessary. This is the accepted custom (Rema). However, some authorities are stringent even with regard to one who is using a prayer book (Aretz Zawah, Biala Yosef, Shulhan Arukh, Orach Hayyim 100:1).

People behind the priests – 442: Anybody standing behind the priests when they bless the people in the synagogue are not included in the blessing. Consequently, those sitting on the east wall of the synagogue must move and stand at least to the side of the priests (Yaz. Bal.). Furthermore, everyone must turn his face toward the priests, not the wall (Shulhan Arukh Halakot, Mishna Berura). Provided that one is standing in front of the priests or to their sides, not even an iron barrier is considered an interference between them with regard to the blessing. Even those who cannot come due to circumstances beyond their control, e.g., those in the fields, are included in the Priestly Blessing (Shulhan Arukh, Orach Hayyim 128:24).

Rabban Gamliel allowed the prayer leader to exempt only those people in the fields – Shabbat: Rabbi Yehuda ben Levi was one of the great Babylonian Sages of the second generation of amora'im. He studied under both Rav and Shmuel. Shmuel often spoke highly of Rav Yehuda and even remarked in admiration: This cannot be an ordinary mortal. Following Shmuel’s passing, Rav Yehuda was appointed head of the Neharde’a academy in his stead. He moved the academy to his hometown of Pumbedita, where it remained for over seven hundred years and produced many of the Jewish nation’s leading scholars.

In addition to his scholarship, Rav Yehuda was known for his piety, and it was said about him that he did not walk four cubits standing fully upright due to his fear of sin. His life was devoted entirely to Torah study, and he lived in poverty until he was appointed head of the academy. Most scholars of the third generation of amora'im were Rav Yehuda’s students, including his son, Rav Yitzhak. Even those who studied in the academy in Sura became his students after Rav Huna’s passing. Although Rav Yehuda believed that there are biblical verses that prohibit moving to Eretz Yisrael from Babylonia, he was well known for his love of Eretz Yisrael. In fact, most of his students emigrated to Eretz Yisrael, where they became leading amora'im.

The Gemara discusses the matter itself. Rav Hananel said that Rav said: Once one has recited the line of the prayer: And in Your Torah it is written, saying, it is no longer necessary to recite the verses themselves. The Gemara clarifies the scope of this ruling: Some understood from this that it applies only to an individual; however, with regard to a congregation, no, this is not the case. Nevertheless, it is stated that Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi said: Both with regard to an individual and a congregation, once one has recited: And in Your Torah it is written, saying, it is no longer necessary to recite the verses.

Rabbi Elazar said: A person should always arrange his prayer in his mind and only then pray. Th Rabbi Abba said: Rabbi Elazar’s statement is reasonable with regard to the blessings of Rosh HaShana and Yom Kippur and in the case of prayers that are recited only intermittently. However, with regard to blessings recited all year, no, this practice is not necessary.

The Gemara asks: Is that so? Didn’t Rav Yehuda first arrange his prayer in his mind and only then pray, even on an ordinary day? The Gemara answers: Rav Yehuda was different, since he would pray only once every thirty days. During the rest of the month he would not engage in prayer, as he was busy with Torah study. Therefore, for him even regular weekdays prayers were like prayers recited intermittently.

Rav Aha bar Avira said that Rabbi Shimon Hasida said: Rabban Gamliel would allow the prayer leader to exempt even the people who were in the fields and away from the synagogue. The Gemara challenges: This statement implies that the prayer leader exempts even the people in the fields, and needless to say, he exempts those who are here in the city but did not attend the prayer service in the synagogue.

The Gemara questions this conclusion: On the contrary, the opposite is more reasonable: Those in the fields did not come to the synagogue due to circumstances beyond their control, and therefore they should be allowed to fulfill their obligation through the prayer leader. By contrast, those in the city were not prevented from coming to the synagogue due to circumstances beyond their control. Consequently, they should not fulfill their obligation through the prayer leader.

As Abba, son of Rav Binyamin bar Hiyya, taught in a baraita: Those people standing in the synagogue behind the priests during the Priestly Blessing, who are not positioned in front of them, face-to-face, are not included in the blessing. They are expected to make the minimal effort to stand in front of the priests. However, those in the fields are included in the Priestly Blessing.

Rather, Rabban Gamliel’s statement should be understood differently: When Ravin came from Eretz Yisrael to Babylonia, he reported that Rabbi Ya’akov bar Idi said that Rabbi Shimon bar Hasida said: Rabban Gamliel allowed the prayer leader to exempt only the people in the fields. What is the reason for this? Because the people in the fields are unable to come to the synagogue due to work circumstances beyond their control, and do not have time to prepare their prayers. However, Rabban Gamliel did not exempt those in the city who do not come to the synagogue, as they are able to prepare their prayers and pray by themselves.

PERSONALITIES

Raw Yehuda – Pirkei Avot: Rav Yehuda bar Hweikel was one of the great Babylonian Sages of the second generation of amoraim. He studied under both Rav and Shmuel. Shmuel often spoke highly of Rav Yehuda and even remarked in admiration: This cannot be an ordinary mortal. Following Shmuel’s passing, Rav Yehuda was appointed head of the Neharde’a academy in his stead. He moved the academy to his hometown of Pumbedita, where it remained for over seven hundred years and produced many of the Jewish nation’s leading scholars.

In addition to his scholarship, Rav Yehuda was known for his piety, and it was said about him that he did not walk four cubits standing fully upright due to his fear of sin. His life was devoted entirely to Torah study, and he lived in poverty until he was appointed head of the academy.

Most scholars of the third generation of amoraim were Rav Yehuda’s students, including his son, Rav Yitzhak. Even those who studied in the academy in Sura became his students after Rav Huna’s passing. Although Rav Yehuda believed that there are biblical verses that prohibit moving to Eretz Yisrael from Babylonia, he was well known for his love of Eretz Yisrael. In fact, most of his students emigrated to Eretz Yisrael, where they became leading amoraim.

People who were in the fields – Perek HaTalmud: The early authorities are puzzled by Rabban Gamliel’s exemption of those who are in the fields. It apparently contradicts the opinions of both Rabban Gamliel and the Rabbis in the dispute in the mishna that pertains to those who are or are not expert, as here Rabban Gamliel exempts only those who are victims of circumstances beyond their control. Some explain that Rabban Gamliel’s exemption is referring to those in the fields who did not come to the synagogue at all, whereas the dispute with regard to experts is referring to those who are in the synagogue. It is further stated in the Jerusalem Talmud that one must hear the entire prayer of the prayer leader, a ruling accepted by most halachic authorities. In this case, the prayer leader fulfills the obligation of experts as well (Tosefot Yom Tov). Some texts read: Rabban Gamliel exempts those in the synagogue as well as those in the fields (Ramban; Rabbeinu Hananel). According to this version, there is no contradiction between the two statements of Rabban Gamliel.

RABBI ELAZAR: A person should arrange his prayer in his mind and only then pray. However, with regard to a congregation, no, this is not the case. Nevertheless, it is stated that Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi said: Both with regard to an individual and a congregation, once one has recited: And in Your Torah it is written, saying, it is no longer necessary to recite the verses. RAV AHA BAR AVIRA: Rabbi Shimon Hasida said: Rabban Gamliel would allow the prayer leader to exempt even the people who were in the fields and away from the synagogue. The Gemara challenges: This statement implies that the prayer leader exempts even the people in the fields, and needless to say, he exempts those who are here in the city but did not attend the prayer service in the synagogue.