

If old men say to you: Demolish – אם יאמרו לך זקנים – וקטנים: What is the connection between this teaching and the previous Gemara? Some suggest that the Gemara here warns: Even if one's judgment tells him that it would be better not to read the curses so near to the new year, nevertheless, he should rely on the old men, i.e., Ezra and the Men of the Great Assembly who enacted these readings, and act based on their wisdom and experience (*Re'ah Duda'im*).

HALAKHA

The place in the Torah where the congregation concludes – מקום שמתפסקין – It is from the place in the Torah where the congregation concludes the reading on Shabbat morning that they read in the afternoon service on Shabbat, on Monday morning, on Thursday morning, and on the coming Shabbat (*Tur, Orah Hayyim* 292).

בשלמא שבמטתה תורה איבא כדי שתכלה שנה וקללותיה, אלא שבתורת כהנים, אטו עצרת ראש השנה היא? אין, עצרת נמי ראש השנה היא, דתנן: ובעצרת על פירות האילן.

The Gemara asks: **Granted**, with regard to the curses that are recorded in **Deuteronomy**, there is relevance to the reason: **In order that the year may conclude together with its curses**, for Rosh HaShana is clearly the beginning of a new year. **However**, with regard to the curses that are recorded in **Leviticus**, what relevance does that reason have? **Is that to say Shavuot is a new year?** The Gemara answers: **Yes**, indeed, *Shavuot is also a new year*, as we learned in a mishna (*Rosh HaShana* 16a): **And on Shavuot**, divine judgment is made **concerning the fruit of the trees**, which indicates that *Shavuot* also has the status of a new year.

תנא, רבי שמעון בן אלעזר אומר: אם יאמרו לך זקנים סתור, וילדים בנה – סתור ואל תבנה, מפני שסתירת זקנים – בנין, ובנין נערים – סתירה, וסימן לדבר: רחבעם בן שלמה.

It is taught in a *baraita*: **Rabbi Shimon ben Elazar says: If old men say to you: Demolish^N and children say to you: Build**, then **demolish and do not build**, because the demolishing of old men is ultimately as constructive as **building**, despite the fact that it appears destructive, and the **building of children** is as destructive as **demolishing**. An indication of this matter is **Rehoboam, son of Solomon**. He ignored the advice of the Elders and did not lower himself before his people, which ultimately led to the people rebelling against him.

תנו רבנן: מקום שמתפסקין בשבת שחרית שם קורין במנחה, במנחה – שם קורין בשני, בשני – שם קורין בחמישי, בחמישי – שם קורין לשבת הבאה, דברי רבי מאיר. רבי יהודה אומר: מקום שמתפסקין בשבת שחרית – שם קורין במנחה, ובשני ובחמישי ולשבת הבאה.

The Sages taught in a *baraita*: With regard to the place in the Torah where the congregation concludes^H the reading on Shabbat morning, it is from there that they continue to read in the afternoon service on Shabbat. Where they conclude in the afternoon service on Shabbat, from there they continue to read on Monday morning. Where they conclude on Monday, from there they continue to read on Thursday morning. Where they conclude on Thursday, from there they continue to read on the coming Shabbat. This is the statement of Rabbi Meir. Rabbi Yehuda says: With regard to the place in the Torah where they conclude the reading on Shabbat morning, it is from there that they continue to read in the afternoon service on Shabbat. And from that same place they continue to read on Monday morning, and on Thursday morning, and on the coming Shabbat.

אמר רבי זירא: הלכה, מקום שמתפסקין בשבת שחרית – שם קורין במנחה ובשני ובחמישי ולשבת הבאה. ולימא: הלכה ברבי יהודה!

The Gemara notes that **Rabbi Zeira said: The halakha** is that with regard to the place where they conclude the reading on Shabbat morning, it is from there that they continue to read in the afternoon service on Shabbat. And from that same place they continue to read on Monday morning, and on Thursday morning, and on the coming Shabbat. The Gemara asks: If so, let him simply say: **The halakha is in accordance with the opinion of Rabbi Yehuda**. Why did he have to explicitly state the whole *halakha*?

Perek IV

Daf 32 Amud a

משום דאפקי להו.

The Gemara answers: **Because there are those who reversed the names^N in the baraita** and attributed the position of Rabbi Yehuda to Rabbi Meir, and vice versa. Therefore, in order to avoid any lack of clarity, Rabbi Zeira stated the *halakha* explicitly.

NOTES

משום – משום: Because there are those who reversed the names – דאפקי להו: Why didn't Rabbi Zeira simply state that the *halakha* is in accordance with the mishna, which also expresses Rabbi Yehuda's opinion? Some explain that even this would be insufficient, because the mishna itself is somewhat ambiguous. From

the formulation of the mishna, one could have understood that the reading on Monday continues from where the reading on Shabbat afternoon concluded, and then the reading on Thursday continues from where the reading on Monday concluded. Therefore, it was necessary for him to state the *halakha* explicitly (Ran).

He should open the scroll, and see the place, and he should recite the blessing – פותח וְרוֹאֶה וּמְבַרֵךְ: The *halakha* is in accordance with Rabbi Yehuda. One should open the scroll, see the place from which one will read, and then, without necessarily closing the scroll again, recite the blessing. However, some hold that even Rabbi Yehuda agrees that ideally one should first close the scroll (*Magen Avraham*, citing *Tosafot*). This is the custom in Hasidic communities.

Some say that one should leave the scroll open and turn one's face to the side when reciting the blessing. Some say that one should turn one's face to the left (*Rema*), others say one should turn one's face to the right (*Arukh HaShulhan*). Sephardic communities are accustomed to following this practice. Many even cover the scroll with a cloth during the blessings. Some say that one should rely on the many authorities who hold that one should leave the scroll open, and there is no need to turn one's face away at all (*Rambam; Bah*). Many follow this custom, especially in Ashkenazic communities (*Shulhan Arukh, Orah Hayyim 139:4*).

The boards – הלוחות: Boards upon which children have written words of Torah as part of their study do not have the sanctity of a Torah scroll, but they do have the sanctity of a synagogue. Some understand that the Gemara is referring to the boards upon which the translator and the person reading *maftir* stand (*Rambam Sefer Ahava, Hilkhhot Sefer Torah 10:4*, and in the comment of *Ra'avad*).

The platforms – הבימות: The platform upon which the reader or prayer leader stands does not have the sanctity of a Torah scroll, but it does have the sanctity of a synagogue (*Shulhan Arukh, Orah Hayyim 154:7*).

He needs to position it so that it closes on the seam – צריך שיעמידנו על התפר: One who furls a Torah scroll should position it upon the seam, so that if it tears, it will tear only upon the seam (*Shulhan Arukh, Orah Hayyim 147:3*).

He should roll it from the outside – גוללו מבחוץ: When tying a Torah scroll closed, the wrapping cloth should first be placed on the underside of the scroll and then wrapped around and tucked in or tied on the text side. When one person both holds the scroll and rolls it, the text should face the person furling it and tying it up. However, in Ashkenazic communities, where one person raises the scroll and then another person furls it, the text should face the one who raises it (*Shulhan Arukh, Orah Hayyim 147:4*, and in the comment of *Rema*).

תנו רבנן: פותח וְרוֹאֶה, גולל ומברך, וחוזר ופותח וְקורא, דברי רבי מאיר. רבי יהודה אומר: פותח וְרוֹאֶה ומברך וקורא.

מאי טעמא דרבי מאיר – בדעולא, דאמר עולא: מפני מה אמרו הקורא בתורה לא יסייע למתורגמן – כדי שלא יאמרו תרגום כתוב בתורה, הכא נמי – כדי שלא יאמרו ברכות כתובין בתורה.

ורבי יהודה: תרגום איכא למיטעי, ברכות – ליכא למיטעי.

אמר רבי זירא אמר רב מתנה: הלכה, פותח וְרוֹאֶה ומברך וקורא. ולימא הלכה כרבי יהודה! משום דאפקי להו.

אמר רבי זירא אמר רב מתנה: הלוחות והבימות אין בהן משום קדושה.

אמר רבי שפטיה אמר רבי יוחנן: הגולל ספר תורה צריך שיעמידנו על התפר.

ואמר רבי שפטיה אמר רבי יוחנן: הגולל ספר תורה – גוללו מבחוץ ואין גוללו מבפנים.

The Sages taught in a *baraita*: When a person reads from the Torah, he should open the scroll and see the place from where he will read, he should furl it so that it is closed, and recite the blessing, and then he should again open the scroll, and read. This is the statement of Rabbi Meir. Rabbi Yehuda said: He should open the scroll, and see the place from where he will read, and, without closing it again, he should recite the blessing,^H and read.

The Gemara asks: What is the reason for Rabbi Meir's opinion that the blessing is not recited over an open scroll? The Gemara answers: His reasoning is in accordance with the statement of Ulla, as Ulla said: For what reason did the Sages say that one who reads from the Torah should not assist the translator, but rather the translation should be exclusively said by the translator? In order that people should not say that the translation is written in the Torah. Here too, the scroll should be closed when reciting the blessings, in order that people should not say that the blessings are written in the Torah.

And Rabbi Yehuda is not concerned about this, as he claims that with regard to the translation, there is the possibility of people erring in this way, but with regard to the blessings, there is no concern about people erring. People will realize the blessings are not actually part of the Torah's text because they are recited by each person who reads.

Rabbi Zeira said that Rav Mattana said: The *halakha* is that he should open the scroll, see the place from which he will read, and, without closing it again, he should recite the blessing and read. The Gemara asks: If so, let him simply say: The *halakha* is in accordance with the opinion of Rabbi Yehuda. Why did he have to explicitly state the whole *halakha*? The Gemara answers: Because there are those who reversed the names in the *baraita* and attributed the position of Rabbi Yehuda to Rabbi Meir and vice versa. In order to avoid any lack of clarity, Rabbi Zeira stated the *halakha* explicitly.

Rabbi Zeira said that Rav Mattana said: The boards,^{HN} i.e., the empty margins of a Torah scroll, and the platforms^{HN} from which the Torah is read do not have any sanctity.

S Rabbi Shefatya said that Rabbi Yoḥanan said: When one furls a Torah scroll, he needs to position it so that it closes on the seam^H between two sheets of parchment. Once closed, the seam should be between the two rolls of the scroll, so that if it is mishandled or overly tightened, it will come apart along the seam and not be torn across the writing.

And Rabbi Shefatya said that Rabbi Yoḥanan said: When one rolls a Torah scroll from one section to another, he should roll it from the outside,^H i.e., he should position the scroll so the two rollers are parallel to him and then roll the scroll by rotating the roller farthest away from him by rotating it toward himself, and he should not roll it from the inside, by rotating the roller nearest to him away from himself. If one does this and loses control, the scroll could roll away from him onto the floor.

NOTES

Boards – לוחות: Rashi explains that these are boards on which the children would write during their Torah study. The *Arukh* explains that the boards are the empty margins of a Torah scroll.

Platforms – בימות: Rashi and the Rambam understand that this is referring to the stage that would be constructed for the king to stand upon when reading the Torah in the Assembly

held during the Festival of *Sukkot* of the year following the Sabbatical year (Deuteronomy 31:10–13). Others explain that the reference is to the table in the synagogue upon which the Torah is read and where the prayer leader sometimes stands (*Rabbeinu Yehonatan; Ritva*). The *Arukh* offers that it is the empty margins of the Torah scroll, above and below the text. Others explain that it is referring to the holders on which the Torah scroll is rolled (*Rid*).

The greatest among them – הגדול שבהם: The greatest of the people who read from the Torah should furl it. The term furling here refers both to raising it up and then furling it (*Mishna Berura*). Some say that the most important person in the synagogue should do this (*Magen Avraham*). This is indeed the custom (*Mishna Berura*). Many communities are accustomed to sell the honor for significant sums. In more recent times, the custom is not to be particular that only the most important people receive the honor. Some even give the honor to a minor who is already aware of the concepts of sanctity (*Mishna Berura*, citing *Sha'arei Efrayim; Shulhan Arukh, Orach Hayyim* 147:1).

וכשהוא מִהֲדִקוּ מִבְּפָנִים, וְאִינוּ מִהֲדִקוּ מִבְּחוּץ.

And when one tightens the scroll, after he has found the new section, he should tighten it from the inside,ⁿ by rotating the roller nearest to him, and not from the outside, by rotating the roller furthest away from him, in order not to extend his arms over the text of the Torah and obscure the view of the community, for it is a mitzva for them to be able to see the text.

וְאָמַר רַבִּי שִׁפְטִיָּה אָמַר רַבִּי יוֹחָנָן: עֲשֵׂה שְׂקָרָאוּ בַתּוֹרָה – הַגְדוּל שְׁבֵהֶם גּוֹלֵל סֵפֶר תּוֹרָה. הַגּוֹלֵלוֹ נוֹטֵל שָׂכָר כּוֹלֵן, דְּאָמַר רַבִּי יְהוֹשֻׁעַ בֶּן לֵוִי: עֲשֵׂה שְׂקָרָאוּ בַתּוֹרָה – הַגּוֹלֵל סֵפֶר תּוֹרָה קִיבֵל שָׂכָר כּוֹלֵן. שָׂכָר כּוֹלֵן סֵלְקָא דְעֵתְךָ? אֵלָּא אֵימָא: קִיבֵל שָׂכָר כְּנֶגְדַּי כּוֹלֵן.

And Rabbi Shefatya said that Rabbi Yohanan said: If ten people read from the Torah,ⁿ the greatest among themⁿ should furl the Torah scroll, for this is the most distinguished honor. And the one who furls it takes the reward of all of them, as Rabbi Yehoshua ben Levi said: If ten people read from the Torah, the one who furls it receives the reward of all of them.ⁿ The Gemara asks: Can it enter your mind to say that he actually receives the reward of all of them? Why should all the others forfeit their reward? Rather, say instead: He receives a reward equivalent to that of all of them.

וְאָמַר רַבִּי שִׁפְטִיָּה אָמַר רַבִּי יוֹחָנָן: מִיֵּן שְׁמִשְׁתַּמְשִׁין בְּבֵת קוֹל – שְׁנֵאמַר "וְאֹנֶכְךָ תִּשְׁמַעְנָה דְּבַר מֵאַחֲרֶיךָ לְאָמַר". וְהֵי מִיֵּלִי – דְּשָׁמַע קוֹל גְּבָרָא בְּמַתָּא, וְקוֹל אִיתְתָּא בְּדַבְרָא. וְהוּא דְּאָמַר הֵינּוּ הֵינּוּ, וְהוּא דְּאָמַר לֹא לֹא.

And Rabbi Shefatya said that Rabbi Yohanan said: If one was deliberating about whether to do a certain action, and a Divine Voice indicated what he should do, from where is it derived that one may make use of a Divine Voiceⁿ and rely upon it? As it is stated: "And your ears shall hear a word behind you saying: This is the way, walk in it" (Isaiah 30:21). The Gemara comments: This applies only when one heard a male voice in the city, which is unusual, for men are usually found in the fields, or when one heard a female voice in the fields, for women are generally not found there. Since the voice is unusual, one need not doubt it and may rely upon it. And that applies when the voice repeated its message and said: Yes, yes.ⁿ And that also applies when the voice said: No, no.

וְאָמַר רַבִּי שִׁפְטִיָּה אָמַר רַבִּי יוֹחָנָן: כָּל הַקּוֹרָא בְּלֹא נְעִימָה וְשׁוֹנֵה בְּלֹא זְמֵרָה – עָלָיו הַכְּתוּב אוֹמֵר "וְגַם אֲנִי נִתְתִּי לָהֶם חֻקִּים לֹא טוֹבִים" וְגו'.

And Rabbi Shefatya said that Rabbi Yohanan said: Concerning anyone who reads from the Torah without a melody or studies the Mishna without a song, the verse states: "So too I gave them statutes that were not good, and judgments whereby they should not live" (Ezekiel 20:25), as one who studies Torah through song demonstrates that he is fond of his learning. Furthermore, the tune helps him remember what he has learned.

מִתְקִיף לֵה אֲבִי: מִשּׁוּם דְּלֹא יִדַּע לְבַסּוּמִי קָלָא "מִשְׁפָּטִים לֹא יִחִיו בָּהֶם" קְרִית בֵּיהּ?! אֵלָּא כְּדָרַב מִשְׁרָשִׁיא, דְּאָמַר: שְׁנֵי תַלְמִידֵי חֲכָמִים הָיוּ שְׂבִיבִים בְּעִיר אַחַת וְאִין נוֹחִין זֶה אֶת זֶה בְּהִלְכָה – עָלֵיהֶם הַכְּתוּב אוֹמֵר "וְגַם אֲנִי נִתְתִּי לָהֶם חֻקִּים לֹא טוֹבִים וְמִשְׁפָּטִים לֹא יִחִיו בָּהֶם".

Abaye strongly objects to this: Just because one does not know how to make his voice pleasant, you read concerning him: "And judgments whereby they should not live"? Rather, the verse should be understood in accordance with the statement of Rav Mesharshiyya, who said: Concerning two Torah scholars who dwell in the same city and are not pleasant to one other in matters of halakha, and they quarrel and stir up controversy, the verse states: "So too I gave them statutes that were not good, and judgments whereby they should not live."

NOTES

He should roll it from the outside...and tighten it from the inside – ומִהֲדִקוּ מִבְּפָנִים...וְהִגְדוּלוֹ מִבְּחוּץ. Many explanations have been offered for this directive. The commentary here follows the opinion of Rashi. *Tosafot* and the Rosh, however, cite Rabbeinu Hananel, who says the Gemara refers to the furling of the Torah scroll after one has used it. They explain that after the scroll has been lifted up, the person designated to furl it and tie it up should begin by placing on the outside, i.e., the underside, of the scroll the wrapping cloth used to tie the scroll and then wrap it around the scroll. The wrapping cloth is then tightened by tying it or tucking it into the inside, i.e., the text side, of the scroll. In this way, when the scroll is next opened, one will be able to untie it without needing to turn it over. This is how the *Shulhan Arukh* rules (see HALAKHA).

Another interpretation is offered by Rav Palti Gaon. He explains that typically, when one wishes to tighten a regular scroll, he holds it by one end, entirely unravels it, and then

begins to furl it again, tightly. This is what the Gemara objects to. Instead, the scroll should be tightened with both sides rolled at all times, loosening one side to allow the other to be tightened (see *ge'onim*).

If ten people read from the Torah – עֲשֵׂה שְׂקָרָאוּ בַתּוֹרָה: Some explain that this is referring to the quorum of ten men required for reading the Torah (*Rashba*). Others explain that the reference is to the seven people who read the main portion, the one who reads the *maftir*, the translator, and the leader of the prayers (see *Beit Peretz*).

The one who furls it receives the reward of all of them – הַגּוֹלֵל: סֵפֶר תּוֹרָה קִיבֵל שָׂכָר כּוֹלֵן: The Rambam explains that the greatest one in the congregation reads last from the scroll. Therefore, he is the one to furl the scroll. Since he concludes the mitzva, he receives all of the merit.

שְׁמִשְׁתַּמְשִׁין בְּבֵת – קוֹל: It would appear that the reference to a Divine Voice does not have the same meaning as in other places in the Talmud, where it refers to a heavenly voice, which is a form of prophecy. The reference here is to an echo, the origin of which is unknown. The novelty of this ruling is that it is permitted to follow an auspicious sign particularly in cases where one who is undecided about what to do hears a voice indicating which path to take (*Maharsha*), despite the fact that it is prohibited to use any form of sorcery (see *Tosafot* and *Ritva*).

Yes, yes – הֵינּוּ הֵינּוּ: In many instances, the repetition of a message is an indicator that it is a sign from Heaven (see *Genesis* 41:32; *Ramat Shmuel*). Furthermore, the Gemara elsewhere states that repeating the word: Yes, is a formulation used for making an oath, which would therefore suggest the seriousness of the message (*Maharsha*).

NOTES

Anyone who holds onto an uncovered Torah scroll – כל – האוחז ספר תורה ערום: A different explanation is cited in name of the Ra'avad: One who is not clothed should not hold onto a Torah scroll. Doing so is an affront to the sanctity of the scroll.

It is proper that the cloth be rolled – מוטב תיגלל המטפחת – Some explain that the cloth must be rolled around the scroll, and not the scroll rolled around in the cloth (Rashi; Meiri). Others explain that the intention is that when the scroll is rolled, one should not touch the parchment with one's bare hands. Rather, one should use a cloth to do so. Rav Hai Gaon found difficulty with the current version of the text and offered various emendations. According to one of them, the intention is that the Torah scroll be rolled from place to place in private, and it is better that it remain in its covers than be rolled in public. Alternatively, even if the scroll is rolled in public, it should be covered while doing so. If this is not possible, it is better not to roll it at all.

And Moses declared – וידבר משה: This verse appears at the very conclusion of the portion of Festivals. As such, its very position indicates that even after Moses delineated everything contained in that portion, it was then that he began to expound to the Jewish people about those Festivals (*Meleket Shlomo*).

HALAKHA

Anyone who holds onto an uncovered Torah scroll – כל – האוחז ספר תורה ערום: It is prohibited to hold onto a Torah scroll directly, without using a cloth or the like. Some say that one should not even hold the rollers upon which the scroll is wrapped without an interposition (*Magen Avraham*, citing *Bah*). However, others permit this (*Taz*), and this is the accepted custom (*Arukh HaShulhan*). Nevertheless, some people are particular to act stringently in this regard (*Shulhan Arukh, Oraḥ Ḥayyim 147:1*).

It is proper that the cloth be rolled – מוטב תיגלל המטפחת – It is proper that the cloth cover of a Torah scroll be rolled around the scroll while holding the scroll stationary, and one should not roll the Torah scroll itself in the cloth in order to cover it. This ruling is in accordance with Rabbi Yannai (*Shulhan Arukh, Oraḥ Ḥayyim 147:5*).

אמר רבי פרנך אמר רבי יוחנן: כל האוחז ספר תורה ערום נקבר ערום. ערום סלקא דעתך? אלא אימא: נקבר ערום בלא מצות.

בלא מצות סלקא דעתך?! אלא אמר אביי: נקבר ערום בלא אותה מצוה.

אמר רבי ינאי בריה דרבי ינאי סבא משמיה דרבי ינאי רבה: מוטב תיגלל המטפחת ואל יגלל ספר תורה.

”וידבר משה את מועדי ה' אל בני ישראל” מצותן שיהיו קורין אותן כל אחד ואחד בזמנו: תנו רבנן: משה תיקון להם לישראל שיהיו שואלין ודורשין בענינו של יום, הלכות פסח בפסח, הלכות עצרת בעצרת, הלכות חג בחג.

הדרן עלך בני העיר
וסליקא לה מסכת מגילה

Rabbi Parnakh said that Rabbi Yoḥanan said: Anyone who holds onto an uncovered Torah scroll,^{NH} i.e., holds the parchment directly without anything intervening, will be punished by being buried uncovered. The Gemara asks: Can it enter your mind to say that he will be actually be buried uncovered? Why should he be buried in such a disgraceful manner? Rather, say that he will be buried metaphorically uncovered, i.e., without the merit of having performed mitzvot.

The Gemara again asks: Can it enter your mind to say that he will be buried without the merit of having performed mitzvot? Why should he forfeit the merit of all the mitzvot that he performed during his lifetime? Rather, Abaye said: He will be buried metaphorically uncovered, i.e., without the merit of that mitzva. He forfeits the reward of the mitzva he performed while holding directly onto the parchment.

Rabbi Yannai, son of Rabbi Yannai the Elder, said in the name of Rabbi Yannai the Great: It is proper that the cloth cover of a Torah scroll be rolled^{NH} around the scroll, while holding the scroll stationary, and one should not roll the Torah scroll itself in the cloth in order to cover it.

§ The mishna states: The verse “And Moses declared^N to the children of Israel the appointed seasons of the Lord” (Leviticus 23:44) indicates that part of the mitzva of the Festivals is that they should read the portion relating to them, each one in its appointed time. The Sages taught in a *baraita*: Moses enacted for the Jewish people that they should make halakhic inquiries and expound upon the matter of the day. They should occupy themselves with the *halakhot* of Passover on Passover, with the *halakhot* of Shavuot on Shavuot, and with the *halakhot* of Sukkot on Sukkot.